Date: April 30, 2019

To: Rapid Board

From: Conrad Venema, Manager off Strategic Planning
Mark Fedorowicz, Manager of Procurement

Subject: CONTRACT AWARD FOR CONDUCTING A COMPREHENSIVE OPERATIONAL ANALYSIS (COA)

REQUESTED ACTION

Staff recommends that the Board authorize the CEO to execute a contract with Nelson-Nygaard in an amount not to exceed $476,169 to conduct a Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA) for the ITP.

BACKGROUND

The Rapid wishes to contract with a professional planning firm to produce a Comprehensive Operational Analysis (COA) of the fixed-route bus system. A COA was completed in 2005 that delivered both near-term and longer-term recommendations that have since been implemented. Nevertheless the region has since experienced substantial and continuing growth, demographic changes, and changing ridership patterns. As a result of this growth, areas of employment are increasingly becoming more geographically separate from where people live. The COA must address the increasing geographic separation of home-to-work trips in order for The Rapid to be an effective mobility provider. The Rapid is seeking a consultant with expertise in developing and implementing COA's with a truly innovative approach and outcomes. The consultant team must both manage the COA effectively and provide innovated transit solutions in order for The Rapid to be a true mobility integrator for the region. In short, the desire is for more frequency of service, longer service hours, and broader service coverage in the region that can be implemented in a phased approach via three (3) alternate service plans over the course of 6 years.

PROCUREMENT OF SERVICES

In March 2019, after advertising the RFP in Transit Talent, the ITP sent out 12 proposal packets to interested firms. Proposals were due on April 5, 2019 and the ITP received proposals from three firms at that time. Those firms are Four Square/AECOM, Connetics Transportation Group, and Nelson-Nygaard. The RFP was specific that the firm with the highest total score of both the oral presentation and the written proposal would be selected as the most qualified to perform this project.

After an initial evaluation and scoring by the Study Evaluation Committee, the committee short-listed two firms as most qualified to carry out the COA project (see Table 1). Those firms were Nelson-

Nygaard and Connetics Transportation Group. Each firm was asked to make a final presentations to the committee. Federal regulations do not permit an arbitrary number of firms to be selected for the short list. Accordingly, the evaluation committee had to analyze the scores thoroughly to determine which firms realistically had an opportunity to be selected for the contract award. Those firms, which lacked sufficiently high scores, were notified that they were no longer in consideration for the contract award.

Table 1
Evaluation Scores – Proposal

Round 1																	
	Nelson Nygaard						CTG - Connectics Transportation Group						FourSquare/AECOM				
	Qualifications	*Methodology*	*Price*	*Schedule*	*Total*		*Qualifications*	*Methodology*	*Price*	*Schedule*	*Total*		*Qualifications*	*Methodology*	*Price*	*Schedule*	*Total*
Evaluator #1	35	27	23	5	90	Evaluator #1	39	28	20	5	92	Evaluator #1	30	22	25	5	82
Evaluator #2	35	30	24	5	94	Evaluator #2	37	27	23	3	90	Evaluator #2	33	25	25	4	87
Evaluator #3	35	27	24	5	91	Evaluator #3	35	28	23	5	91	Evaluator #3	30	24	25	5	84
Evaluator #4	37	27	24	5	93	Evaluator #4	34	24	23	5	86	Evaluator #4	32	22	25	5	84
Evaluator #5	33	28	25	5	91	Evaluator #5	34	30	23	5	92	Evaluator #5	28	24	25	5	82
Average Total Collective Score					**91.8**				**Avg.**		**90.2**				**Avg.**		**83.8**
TOTAL					459						451						419

The evaluation committee met with the short listed firms on April 22, 2019. Each firm gave a 30-minute presentation and responded to questions from the team for an additional 30-45 minutes. A best and final offer (BAFO) was then requested and the evaluation team members then scored each firm independently and their scores were totaled and added to the Phase I scores. There was a maximum of 60 points per evaluator for the BAFO scoring. The combination of the written proposal and the oral presentations as well as the response to the BAFO clearly indicated that Nelson-Nygaard had the best understanding of the work required and the qualifications needed to carry out the project. The final scores incorporating the oral presentation results are shown in Table 2 below.

Table 2

Best and Final Offer Scoring Adjustment

Round 2 - Interview and BAFO Scores									
	Nelson Nygaard					CTG - Connectics Transportation Group			
	Response to questions	Capability of Team	Intangibles	Total		Response to questions	Capability of Team	Intangibles	Total
Evaluator #1	28	19	9	56	Evaluator #1	26	17	9	52
Evaluator #2	27	21	9	57	Evaluator #2	25	18	7	50
Evaluator #3	28	17	8	53	Evaluator #3	23	15	6	44
Evaluator #4	29	20	10	59	Evaluator #4	22	15	8	45
Evaluator #5	30	20	10	60	Evaluator #5	29	15	10	54
Round 2 Scores				**459**	Round 2 Scores				**451**
Round 1 Scores				**285**	Round 1 Scores				**245**
Total Score				**744**	Total Score				**696**
	Price	**$476,169**				**Price**	**$459,381**		

Staff reviewed the Best and Final Offers of both finalists and believed that the proposal by Nelson-Nygaard was the best in addressing the needs of the ITP. A comparison of Nelson-Nygaard's costs

was also done and both firm's price structure were in-line. Accordingly, we believe the prices to be both fair and reasonable for a study of this scope.

In short, there are many factors that resulted in the selection team recommending Nelson Nygaard. These are as follows:

- Sam Schwartz, a team member of Nelson-Nygaard, is national leader in New Mobility efforts;
- The project manager has a long history of successful projects including increased ridership and more efficient service and has 25 years of experience;
- Byrum and Fisk is very strong local Public Involvement specialist;
- Nelson-Nygaard's methodology allowed for more innovative mobility offerings with implementation that has proven successful in other communities;
- Nelson-Nygaard's local Public Relations presence will more effectively provide insight into the community's will along with the ability to tactfully represent the overall recommendations;
- Sam Schwartz is an industry leader in pioneering mode scale solutions;
- Nelson-Nygaard demonstrated industry-leading knowledge and expertise in emerging and integrated mobility solutions and programs;
- The consultant team demonstrated extensive successful experience coordinating stakeholder outreach and strategic communications in Grand Rapids area;
- Nelson-Nygaard's team has a more clear understanding of the needs and challenges facing The Rapid;
- Nelson-Nygaard's has a proven track record of positive results working with other transit agencies on projects of similar scope and size.

SCHEDULE FOR DELIVERY OF SERVICES

The Nelson-Nygaard team anticipates that barring delays in getting started, they expect the COA process to be completed in approximately 12 months.

FUNDING

Funding for the COA project is completely covered by grants from the Federal Transit Administration. No local dollars will be used for this project.

INTERURBAN TRANSIT PARTNERSHIP BOARD

RESOLUTION NO._____

Fiscal Year 2019

Moved and supported to adopt the following resolution:

Approval of consultant to conduct a Comprehensive Operational Analysis.

BE IT RESOLVED that the ITP CEO is hereby authorized to award and execute an Agreement with Nelson-Nygaard in an amount not to exceed $476,169 on behalf of the Interurban Transit Partnership Board to conduct a Comprehensive Operational Analysis for The Rapid's linehaul services in accordance with the information presented to the ITP Board on May 15, 2019.

CERTIFICATE

The undersigned, duly qualified and acting secretary of the Interurban Transit Partnership Board, certifies that the foregoing is a true and correct copy of a resolution adopted at a legally convened meeting of the Interurban Transit Partnership Board.

_____

Robin Crothers, ITP Board Secretary

_____

Date